

Tewkesbury Borough Council

Results of the Consultation on Mandatory CCTV in licensed vehicles.

Consultation Period: 12th September 2022 to 23rd October 2022.

This was an initial consultation to identify if there are local circumstances which indicate that the installation of CCTV in vehicles would have either a positive or adverse net effect on the safety of taxi and private hire vehicle users, including children or vulnerable adults.

In addition, the consultation is seeking views on whether it would be proportionate for the installation of CCTV to become a mandatory condition of a vehicle license. Any decision to make this a mandatory condition will take into account the benefits to public safety as well as any adverse effects including potential privacy concerns and the costs to the licensed vehicle holder.

Breakdown of Respondee

The breakdown of respondees to the consultation were as follows:

Private Hire License Holder	9
Gloucestershire County Council	1
Total	10

Pages 2 to 6 of this document contain the headline YES/NO results.

Pages 7 - 17 are the full results with all the additional comments made by respondees.

Please note, the response from Gloucestershire County Council will be contained in a separate appendix to this one.

SAFETY OF PASSENGERS – Pages 7 to 9

Do you agree that CCTV in licensed vehicles will benefit the safety of passengers using licensed vehicles?

Yes	6	67%
No	3	33%

Do you agree that additional audio CCTV recording in licensed vehicles will benefit the safety of passengers using licensed vehicles?

Yes	6	67%
No	3	33%

Do you have any local examples of when CCTV (video or audio) was or could have been beneficial to the safety of passengers using licensed vehicles?

Yes	2	22%
No	7	78%

SAFETY OF DRIVERS – Pages 9 to 11

Do you agree that CCTV would benefit the safety of the licensed driver?

Yes	7	87.5%
No	1	12.5%

Do you agree that additional audio CCTV would benefit the safety of the licensed driver?

Yes	7	78%
No	2	22%

Do you have any local examples where CCTV (video or audio) did or could have benefitted the safety of the licensed driver?

Yes	2	22%
No	7	78%

FEAR OF CRIME – Pages 11 to 12

Do you agree that video CCTV would reduce the fear of crime?

Yes	7	78%
No	2	22%

Do you agree that additional audio CCTV recording would reduce the fear of crime?

Yes	5	71%
No	2	29%

Do you have any local examples where CCTV did or could have reduced the fear of crime?

Yes	0	0%
No	7	100%

ADVERSE EFFECTS ON SAFETY OF PASSENGERS – Page 12

In your opinion are there any adverse effects on the safety of passengers, including children or vulnerable adults, by installing CCTV in licensed vehicles?

Yes	1	11%
No	8	89%

ADVERSE EFFECTS ON PRIVACY – Pages 13 to 14

In your opinion are there any adverse effects on the privacy of passengers, including children or vulnerable adults, by installing CCTV in licensed vehicles?

Yes	5	62.5%
No	3	37.5%

In your opinion are there any adverse effects on the privacy of licensed vehicle drivers by installing CCTV in licensed vehicles?

Yes	5	62.5%
No	3	37.5%

In your opinion do the benefits to public safety outweigh any adverse effect on privacy?

Yes	3	33%
No	6	67%

ADVERSE EFFECTS ON COSTS – Page 14

In your opinion do the benefits to public safety outweigh the costs that would be incurred by licensed vehicle drivers by installing CCTV in licensed vehicles?

Yes	4	50%
No	4	50%

ADVERSE EFFECTS (GENERAL) – Pages 14 to 15

Are there any other adverse effects from installing CCTV in licensed vehicles?

Yes	4	44%
No	5	56%

OVERALL – Pages 15 to 16

Overall, do you think that there are local circumstances that would make it proportionate to make it a mandatory requirement for all licensed vehicle operators to install CCTV?

Yes	5	56%
No	4	44%

If yes to question 17 do you think that mandatory CCTV should be video recording only or video and audio?

Video Recording	1	20%
Video and Audio	4	80%

OTHER – Pages 16 to 17

Do you have a Gloucestershire County Council Contract?

Yes	1	11%
No	8	89%

Do you have a CCTV system installed in your current licensed vehicle?

Yes	1	12.5%
No	7	87.5%

Please specify it if is video or video and audio recording.

Video Only	0	0%
Video and Audio	2	100%

Are you registered with the ICO (Information Commissioners Office)?

Yes	0	0%
No	1	100%

Do you display signage in your vehicle making it clear to passengers that CCTV is in operation?

Yes	1	100%
No	0	0%

Are you satisfied that the data that you capture on your CCTV is kept secure?

Yes	1	100%
No	0	0%

PASSENGER COMMENTS ON CCTV – These questions have no extended answers.

Have passengers ever made positive comments about CCTV in operation?

Yes	0	0%
No	1	100%

Have any passengers ever objected to CCTV being in operation?

Yes	0	0%
No	1	100%

EXTENDED ANSWERS

Answers which are in light green are indicative of the comments made by respondees who answered 'YES' to the question, while answers which are in light red are indicative of respondees who answered 'NO' to the question.

Answers which have no colour are indicative of comments made by respondees who did not input a 'YES' or 'NO' answer to the question listed.

SAFETY OF PASSENGERS

Do you agree that CCTV in licensed vehicles will benefit the safety of passengers using licensed vehicles?

YES	6	67%
NO	3	33%

I agree that CCTV in licensed vehicles will benefit the safety of the majority of passengers using licensed vehicles especially women, teenagers and unaccompanied minors, because cameras record history in the making and can be a deterrent to any would be offenders, especially those who exit without paying, cause damage to the vehicles, exert threatening behaviour or violence. However, as Private Hire Operator, all Passenger details must be noted before any journeys commence. This could be transferred to Hackney Carriage Operators too using modern day technology to ensure any passenger exhibiting bad behaviour whilst travelling in a licensed vehicle can be held accountable.

This is a Yes and No answer. Regarding my own clients - I have several clients who are professional sportsmen and women, tv presenters and business leaders who would feel unsafe being recorded as they have private conversations on the phone. They are often on the phone to their agents, new booking agents, their PR team, secretary's etc. Some of the business leaders are on the phone to their HR team about redundancies, new recruits, their salaries etc. After receiving notification of this consultation I have mentioned CCTV to some of my more private clients and for example they do not wish to be on CCTV when they are talking about their salary to their mortgage broker which is a conversation that one of my clients (a professional jockey) had whilst in my vehicle two days ago as it was the only time he and the mortgage broker could converse. Some of my clients would not want what they say to be recorded as it is sensitive information.

It will provide clear evidence of any questioned event and eliminate doubt.
safety for all concerned

A better filtering of the licence holders would benefit the safety of the passengers. Making CCTV in licensed vehicles mandatory would increase the cost to become a licensed driver and more important, would make the drivers more reluctant to changing

vehicles when needed due to increased costs for such a change as new vehicle has to have more added equipment.

While the transportation of persons unknown to the driver, in the case of a Hackney carriage service may be greater security for driver and passenger alike, the use of cameras in private hire vehicles, booked in advance for private use for daily tours would not be appropriate or of benefit. This would impinge on the privacy of clients during their private day tour.

Having run a taxi business in Tewkesbury for 27 years, I have seen drivers assaulted by customers, customers doing a runner and no payment, cameras in the vehicles would be both advantageous to both the driver and customers

Do you agree that additional audio CCTV recording in licensed vehicles will benefit the safety of passengers using licensed vehicles?

YES	6	67%
NO	3	33%

I believe that additional audio CCTV recording in licensed vehicles could benefit the safety of passengers using licensed vehicles because all sorts of conversations occur between Driver and Passengers and between Passengers themselves and it would give a better understanding or overview of the interaction between the said parties. At the last Safeguarding Course I attended, the emphasis was on the behaviour and conduct of Operators and Drivers and not on how the passenger's behaviour or conduct can affect the safety of all concerned and behaviour should be made mandatory inline with the existing vehicle safety guidelines .

This is a Yes and No answer. Regarding my own clients - I have several clients who are professional sportsmen and women, tv presenters and business leaders who would feel unsafe being recorded as they have private conversations on the phone. They are often on the phone to their agents, new booking agents, their PR team, secretary's etc. Some of the business leaders are on the phone to their HR team about redundancies, new recruits, their salaries etc. After receiving notification of this consultation I have mentioned CCTV to some of my more private clients and for example they do not wish to be on CCTV when they are talking about their salary to their mortgage broker which is a conversation that one of my clients (a professional jockey) had whilst in my vehicle two days ago as it was the only time he and the mortgage broker could converse. Some of my clients would not want what they say to be recorded as it is sensitive information.

Incidents can often be just verbal. Thought will have to be given to how private conversations are handled

could be useful if any conflict between passengers and driver

A better filtering of the licence holders would benefit the safety of the passengers. Making CCTV in licensed vehicles mandatory would increase the cost to become a licensed driver and more important, would make the drivers more reluctant to changing vehicles when needed due to increased costs for such a change as new vehicle has to have more added equipment.

Only in the use with Hackney Carriage

Domestic issues between couples, which can lead to violence,

Do you have any local examples of when CCTV (video or audio) was or could have been beneficial to the safety of passengers using licensed vehicles?

YES	2	22%
NO	7	78%

I have local examples of when CCTV (video or audio) could have been beneficial to the safety of my passengers in my vehicle:
HGV's jumping red lights on A46 at Northway Lane. This happens on a regular basis, because the lights are at the bottom of a slight incline and the Vehicles lose kinetic energy when they brake to stop.

Erratic & high speed driving by a BMW in Fiddington Lane. I had to pull over & stop to avoid contact.

Abuse to drivers, driver assaulted, domestic abuse with couples which can also lead to physical abuse on the driver and other passengers

SAFETY OF DRIVERS

Do you agree that CCTV would benefit the safety of the licensed driver?

YES	7	87.5%
NO	1	12.5%

I have examples of when CCTV (Video or audio) could have been beneficial to my own safety as a female driver:

Passenger(s) run off without paying in Gloucester. I went to Gloucester Police station in Central Gloucester to report the incident, but it was closed.

My vehicle was stopped in front of Tewkesbury Abbey & the door handles pulled to see if they would open, by a group of 4 demanding I take them to Cheltenham. On realising the doors were locked, they kicked the doors and threw an object at the windscreen.

Whilst waiting to collect passengers from a Wedding at The Gupshill Manor in Tewkesbury, a group entered my vehicle and tried to molest me refusing to leave until I informed them the Police were on their way.

I was mugged in broad daylight in a Cambridgeshire Country Park whilst waiting in my vehicle for a passenger who was attending her Uncle's 80th Birthday Party. It was fortunate that my doors were locked and only the windows and sunroof were open so they could not complete their intention of taking my phone, my purse, watch and rings. I drove away at speed and reported the incident to Cambridge Police as there were other women in the park with children who could be targeted.

My vehicle door was yanked open as I was driving past The Royal Well Bus Station in Cheltenham by someone demanding I take them to Solihull. I managed to keep hold of the door and shake them off.
Again a yes and no answer - If I were to record my high profile clients I believe they really wouldn't want to book me or at least ask me to turn the cctv off as I say some of their conversations are high profile and they do not want them being released to the media or otherwise.
Complaints will be proved or disproved without doubt
could be useful if any conflict between passengers and driver
It would but I do not believe it should be mandatory, it needs to be at the driver's discretion.
I agree with current regulations.
Only in the use with Hackney Carriage
Overall I feel it would be a deterrent for issues within the vehicle

Do you agree that additional audio CCTV would benefit the safety of the licensed driver?

YES	7	78%
NO	2	22%

I have examples of when CCTV (Video or audio) could have been beneficial to my own safety as a female driver:
<p>Passenger(s) run off without paying in Gloucester. I went to Gloucester Police station in Central Gloucester to report the incident, but it was closed.</p> <p>My vehicle was stopped in front of Tewkesbury Abbey & the door handles pulled to see if they would open, by a group of 4 demanding I take them to Cheltenham. On realising the doors were locked, they kicked the doors and threw an object at the windscreen.</p> <p>Whilst waiting to collect passengers from a Wedding at The Gupshill Manor in Tewkesbury, a group entered my vehicle and tried to molest me refusing to leave until I informed them the Police were on their way.</p> <p>I was mugged in broad daylight in a Cambridgeshire Country Park whilst waiting in my vehicle for a passenger who was attending her Uncle's 80th Birthday Party. It was fortunate that my doors were locked and only the windows and sunroof were open so they could not complete their intention of taking my phone, my purse, watch and rings. I drove away at speed and reported the incident to Cambridge Police as there were other women in the park with children who could be targeted.</p> <p>My vehicle door was yanked open as I was driving past The Royal Well Bus Station in Cheltenham by someone demanding I take them to Solihull. I managed to keep hold of the door and shake them off.</p>
Again a yes and no answer - If I were to record my high profile clients I believe they really wouldn't want to book me or at least ask me to turn the cctv off as I say some of their conversations are high profile and they do not want them being released to the media or otherwise.
Complaints will be proved or disproved without doubt
could be useful if any conflict between passengers and driver

It would but I do not believe it should be mandatory, it needs to be at the driver's discretion.

I agree with current regulations.

Only in the use with Hackney Carriage

Evidence if required

Do you have any local examples where CCTV (video or audio) did or could have benefitted the safety of the licensed driver?

YES	2	22%
NO	7	78%

I have local examples of when CCTV (video or audio) could have been beneficial to the safety of my passengers in my vehicle:
HGV's jumping red lights on A46 at Northway Lane. This happens on a regular basis, because the lights are at the bottom of a slight incline and the Vehicles lose kinetic energy when they brake to stop.
Erratic & high speed driving by a BMW in Fiddington Lane. I had to pull over & stop to avoid contact.

FEAR OF CRIME

Do you agree that video CCTV would reduce the fear of crime?

YES	7	78%
NO	2	22%

I believe that video CCTV would help to reduce the fear of crime in some circumstances, because it's noticeable how differently drivers react when speed cameras or average speed cameras are in place and when they are not in place. Most crime goes undetected because it is not reported or the perpetrators are masked or hooded. I believe women especially would feel safer if a licensed vehicle had video CCTV as long it could be easily established that it was working and live.

In the whole time I've been doing this kind of work I've never once had any kind of incident where I was fearful. All of my clients are upstanding members of society.

Whilst not everyone would feel that way, a lot of people would customers may be less likely to run off without paying

In hackney Carriages

Driver confidence and safety

It should have been an option to answer "not sure"

Do you agree that additional audio CCTV recording would reduce the fear of crime?

YES	5	71%
NO	2	29%

I believe that additional audio CCTV recording would reduce the fear of crime, because for most women, crime starts with unsavoury comments, innuendos or threats.

In the whole time I've been doing this kind of work I've never once had any kind of incident where I was fearful. All of my clients are upstanding members of society.

Whilst not everyone would feel that way, a lot of people would

It should have been an option to answer "not sure"

Only in Hackney Carriage

Do you have any local examples where CCTV did or could have reduced the fear of crime?

YES	0	0%
NO	7	100%

No comments were made in regard to the above question.

ADVERSE EFFECTS ON SAFETY OF PASSENGERS

In your opinion are there any adverse effects on the safety of passengers, including children or vulnerable adults, by installing CCTV in licensed vehicles?

(Please note, only respondees who answered 'YES' to the above question were prompted to give further details)

YES	1	11%
NO	8	89%

As per the reasons ive already stated yes with my own clients there could be adverse affects - ie they may consider this a breach of their privacy and not use me. Specifically for children and vulnerable adults I see no adverse affects with using CCTV.

ADVERSE EFFECTS ON PRIVACY

In your opinion are there any adverse effects on the privacy of passengers, including children or vulnerable adults, by installing CCTV in licensed vehicles?

(Please note, only respondees who answered 'YES' to the above question were prompted to give further details)

YES	5	62.5%
NO	3	37.5%

In my opinion, the only adverse effects on the privacy of passengers, including children or vulnerable adults by installing CCTV in licensed vehicles is intrusion to their freedom of movement.

As per the reasons ive already stated yes with my own clients there could be adverse affects - ie they may consider this a breach of their privacy and not use me. Specifically for children and vulnerable adults I see no adverse affects with using CCTV.

like anything it depends on how it is used

As a Blue Badge Driver guide, confidence is already there when booking the private tour. Private filming and scrutiny of passengers and driver would be totally unacceptable to the visitors.

In your opinion are there any adverse effects on the privacy of licensed vehicle drivers by installing CCTV in licensed vehicles?

(Please note, only respondees who answered 'YES' to the above question were prompted to give further details)

YES	5	62.5%
NO	3	37.5%

In my opinion, the only adverse effect on the privacy of licensed vehicle drivers by installing CCTV in licensed vehicles would be the loss of the private conversations enjoyed by many drivers with their passengers. Passengers offload all manor of issues during a journey and that intmicity would be lost.

I may lose several of my key clients if this is brought in.....for reasons ive stated previously. Some of my clients are high profile sportsmen and women, i even have the odd musician. They do not want their conversations to be recorded. For example when they are expressing their opinion about politics, the government, etc. They may be fearful that the recorded footage may be used against them - not by me - but a hacker can probably hack my stored camera footage on my PC. It already costs me a small fortune to

run my vehicle/be insured/pay for the correct licenses etc I really don't need any more expenses my installing and maintaining/replacing a CCTV system.

like anything it depends on how it is used

I would not be comfortable to be mandatory monitored, even if it's my own device.

It gives an impression that such arrangements are necessary for their safety and that the day is not as private as required by the client.

In your opinion do the benefits to public safety outweigh any adverse effect on privacy?

(Please note, only respondees who answered 'YES' to the above question were prompted to give further details)

YES	3	33%
NO	6	67%

No comments were made in regard to the above question.

ADVERSE EFFECTS ON COSTS

In your opinion do the benefits to public safety outweigh the costs that would be incurred by licensed vehicle drivers by installing CCTV in licensed vehicles?

(Please note, only respondees who answered 'YES' to the above question were prompted to give further details)

YES	4	50%
NO	4	50%

yes but CCTV has got to come at a sensible price given there are so many different fees and charges and costs which a company has to bear.

ADVERSE EFFECTS (GENERAL)

Are there any other adverse effects from installing CCTV in licensed vehicles?

(Please note, only respondees who answered 'YES' to the above question were prompted to give further details)

YES	4	44%
NO	5	56%

They must work! If they are to be installed, there must be a guarantee for the passenger that they are operational. Crime could profit from having non-working CCTV giving the Passenger false assurances.

Yes I'm sure there are. If they are on as soon as the engine is running then yes. The public have a right to privacy. I may be running a family errand. I certainly dont need or want my kids to be recorded on camera like that.

I mentioned them in previous answers:
Increased costs would determine a slower rate of renewing vehicles.
Privacy of both passengers and driver.

OVERALL

Overall, do you think that there are local circumstances that would make it proportionate to make it a mandatory requirement for all licensed vehicle operators to install CCTV?

YES	5	56%
NO	4	44%

I think that there are local circumstances that would make it proportionate to make it a mandatory requirement for all licensed vehicle Operators to install CCTV because, overall, CCTV captures real time which can assist criminal, incidental & accidental occurrences and reassure passengers of their safety whilst travelling.

are we any different to anywhere else?

Local crime rate circumstances do not require such a mandatory regulation.

Past and probably future issues with abuse and violence towards the driver

If yes to question 17 do you think that mandatory CCTV should be video recording only or video and audio?

In this instance, answers in light green are indicative of comments given by respondees who answered 'VIDEO RECORDING' and answers in light red are indicative of comments given by respondees who answered 'VIDEO AND AUDIO'.

VIDEO RECORDING	1	20%
VIDEO AND AUDIO	4	80%

I think that there are local circumstances that would make it proportionate to make it a mandatory requirement for all licensed vehicle Operators to install CCTV because, overall, CCTV captures real time which can assist criminal, incidental & accidental occurrences and reassure passengers of their safety whilst travelling.

Evidence

OTHER

Are you satisfied that the data that you capture on your CCTV is kept secure?

YES	1	100%
NO	0	0%

I have a camera which records outwards, i.e. it only records incidents outside the vehicle whilst I am travelling. I do not have a CCTV System installed to record inside the vehicle.

Do you have any other comments to make?

If CCTV is to be made mandatory, it should be published where and how to buy it and significant measures should be in place to ensure pricing is set competitively. It is becoming incredibly difficult financially to run licensed vehicles because of the ever-increasing operating costs, such as Insurance, Licensing, Wear & Tear, depreciation, fuel parking, etc. along with the unsociable hours, longer hours out on the road because of diversions, road works, smart motorways, accidents, incidents, Police holding the traffic etc. You need nerves of steel to be out on the road now because of unlicensed & uninsured drivers, dangerous driving, road conditions including pot holes and spilt diesel, accumulating water on road surfaces, climate change causing monsoon downpours resulting in visibility issues etc. Commercial issues such as flights being cancelled, strikes, protests etc. And finally, to cap it all, we will all be expected to drive electric cars or use driverless cars soon, a money making spin for the motor industry in my opinion, because of the amount of Co2 involved in producing these so called 'Green' cars, disposing of the batteries and the generating of electricity to run them and the amount of poisonous toxins they release from the tyres because of the weight of the batteries! I really hope an alternative solution is offered before the removal of all petrol and diesel cars. I believe they should be looking at additives to remove the harmful effects of emissions, rather than producing tons of Co2 in the manufacture of new, inefficient electric cars.

This would no doubt protect vulnerable adults and children....but I do feel it's a huge invasion of privacy and I believe some of my high profile clients would not want to be recorded visually or audio. I believe it should be in place for all school contracts, or contracts where vulnerable adults are taken as part of a regular journey to/from a place of education/work etc. But this isn't something that's required for every single human being.

The way of phrasing some of the questions makes it harder to give the desired answer because of lack of appropriate options to answer, and some seem to be leading to an underlying desired answer.

You are joining together 2 completely different services. As a qualified Blue Badge driver guide our service is completely different to Hackney Carriage service. Professional connection is made with clients prior to the booking and a private service is required without.

END OF DOCUMENT